

LANDMARK PRESERVATION COMMISSION
Regular Meeting
October 13, 2004 Minutes
City Council Liaison: David Roy (407-7393)
Staff Liaison: Joe Frank (221-6376)
Commission Chair: W. J. "Bud" Frick, Jr. (484-1467)

SUMMARY OF MEETING: LPC approved a change to the second floor front façade door at 516 S. Meldrum, Garnick House; gutters for 612 S. College Ave., Darrah House; replacement of rear fire escape at 236 Linden St., Bernard Block; and plans for new and rehabilitated loafing sheds at the Nix Farm Natural Areas Maintenance Center. LPC also accepted a proposal for lead paint abatement at Nix Farm East Farmhouse and determined 210 W. Mulberry St. is not individually eligible for Fort Collins Landmark designation. Carol Tunner presented training on the F.R.E.S.H. approach to new construction in historic districts.

CALL TO ORDER AND ROLL CALL: Commission called to order with a quorum present by Chairman Bud Frick at 5:35 p.m. at 281 N. College Ave., Fort Collins, Colorado. Angie Aguilera, Agnes Dix, Per Hogestad and Ian Shuff were present. Janet Ore was excused. Karen McWilliams and Carol Tunner represented City staff. No City Council members were present.

GUESTS: Rena and Rudy Hansch, owners, for 516 S. Meldrum, Garnick House; William Chelales for 236 Linden St., Bernard Block; Steve White, Facilities Manager, City of Fort Collins, for Nix Farm; Dana Lockwood, owner's representative, for 210 W. Mulberry St.

AGENDA REVIEW: An updated agenda was distributed, adding Lead Paint Abatement on the small east farm house at Nix Farm, 1745 Hoffman Mill Road, to Current Review, and a gutter change to K-style for the No-Interest Landmark Loan Program for 612 S. College Ave., Darrah House, to Other Business.

MINUTES: Minutes of August 25, 2004, were accepted as presented.

STAFF REPORTS: Carol Tunner announced that due to a conflict with the event honoring Board and Commission members, the November 10 LPC meeting is cancelled. Possible rescheduling will depend on demand. She added that Per Hogestad will be recognized at the event for 11 years of service to the City of Fort Collins. The November 24 meeting will also be cancelled because of the Thanksgiving holiday.

Ms. Tunner also distributed copies of a list of local Architectural Salvage stores, compiled as part of her research into sources of historic doors. She also asked for volunteers to accompany her to the Historic Preservation Commission Forum in Berthoud on October 30. Agnes Dix said she would go.

COMMISSION MEMBER REPORTS: None

CURRENT REVIEW

1. **516 S. Meldrum, Garnick House – Door Changes to the Approved Plan –** Rena and Rudy Hansch, owners; introduced by Carol Tunner. This item was brought forward from the September 22, 2004, agenda, at which time LPC declined to give direction until the owners could be present.

According to staff, the owner was having difficulty finding a 32-inch wide door with a half-light and two panels to match the historic 1948 photo submitted for the Local Landmark Rehabilitation No-Interest Loan and approved by the LPC in April 2004.

The owners shared photos of the work that has been completed, saying they were pleased with the way it has turned out. Rena Hansch explained that they want to do something with the inoperable door on the second floor front façade. Right now the opening is covered with plywood; any door would open onto the back stud wall of a closet. After recounting her search for a door that would match the historic photo, she said they realized that the 60-year-old wooden screen rear door to the basement is the exact dimensions needed for the front and would perfectly fit the existing jamb. The basement door has not been in use, moving it to the front would not replace any existing historic fabric, and it would be reversible. Rudy Hansch said they would experiment with the color scheme, perhaps painting it to match the downstairs front door.

Per Hogestad and Ian Shuff agreed that this is a good solution that will work. It is also inexpensive and preserves historic fabric.

Public input: William Chelales also commended the Hansches on the work on the rear fire escape. The Commission agreed.

Ian Shuff moved that the LPC approve the relocation of the historic screen door from the rear elevation of 516 S. Meldrum to the upper front, to be installed in the existing plywood-covered door opening; the stylistic metal dog guard will be removed before the door is relocated, the background behind the door will be painted in the body color of the existing siding and the door will be painted green to match the front downstairs door. Agnes Dix seconded, and the motion passed unanimously, 5-0.

The owners will submit photos of the relocated door to Carol Tunner.

2. **236 Linden St., Bernard Block – Replace Rear Fire Escape, Conceptual/Final Review –** William Chelales, tenant, dba Lil Nic's Restaurant; introduced by Carol Tunner.

The applicant is converting the second floor of the Bernard Block, above Elliot's Martini Bar, from offices to a restaurant. That use requires a safer rear fire escape than the existing three-foot-wide one. The proposed staircase is six feet wide steel welded construction fastened to the building in the same way as the existing one. It will descend to the north to a landing, turn, and then descend facing east in the parking lot. The applicant would prefer a black color. Staff recommends approving the new fire escape, noting that a terra cotta color would be less noticeable than black, but color is a design issue, not a historic preservation issue.

William Chelales said the new design is required to bring the fire escape up to City Code. He shared drawings by Charles Robinson Engineering that showed the existing rounded posts replaced with 3-inch square steel tubing, as well as safety tread flooring and a steel handrail. He said it would also have a concrete base step.

Per Hogestad suggested that the terra cotta color, like that used on the Antlers next door, would be less noticeable than the proposed black. Ian Shuff added it would be more respectful to the surrounding buildings. Mr. Chelales agreed to paint the fire escape terra cotta color.

Public input: None.

Per Hogestad moved that the LPC approve the new fire escape for 236 Linden St., Bernard Block, as submitted, painted a terra cotta color. Angie Aguilera seconded, and the motion passed unanimously, 5-0.

- 3. 1745 Hoffman Mill Road, Nix Farm: Natural Areas Maintenance Center, Rehabilitate Loafing Shed, Build New Shed, Conceptual/Final Review – Ian Shuff, Aller-Lingle Architects; introduced by Carol Tunner.**

Mr. Shuff completed a conflict of interest form to be filed with the City Clerk's office and recused himself from voting on this project, so he could represent the applicant, City of Fort Collins Operations Services Department.

This project is two-fold: to rehabilitate the existing loafing shed and to build a new shed of similar construction to the west of the existing one. The existing shed, open to the south, is in poor condition, needing work on the roof, support posts and walls. Existing support posts will be replaced with 8-inch diameter wood posts on new concrete piers. The existing side-to-side roof front support beam will be replaced with a new roughsawn wood beam. A new corrugated galvanized metal roof will be installed over the existing skip sheathing, which will be repaired. Damaged siding, rafters and fascia will be replaced. The new loafing shed will have a split height with the higher level to the west to accommodate

higher vehicles. Its construction materials will be similar to the existing shed. The flooring and roadway surface for both buildings will be recycled asphalt.

Ian Shuff explained that he had been asked by the City's Natural Resources Department to submit plans for the sheds to accommodate equipment storage. The existing shed is part of the historic Nix Farm site but not historic itself. Bud Frick suggested using square columns on the new shed to differentiate it from the older structure. But Per Hogestad pointed out that the new concrete pour will look different. The Commission felt the proposed steps to change the height of the new shed would be acceptable.

Public input: None.

Per Hogestad moved that the LPC approve the design for the Nix farm existing loafing shed rehabilitation and new shed construction as presented. Angie Aguilera seconded, and the motion passed unanimously, 4-0.

Mr. Shuff said research was underway to determine the exact date of the existing shed, but it is definitely less than 50 years old. Ms. Aguilera suggested dating the new shed when the concrete is poured.

4. 1745 Hoffman Mill Road, Nix Farm: Small House Lead Paint Abatement – Steve White, City of Fort Collins Facility Manager; introduced by Carol Tunner.

Ms. Tunner explained that the building under discussion is the east farm house. She shared photos that showed half of the paint is missing; what's left contains lead. The first plan was to encapsulate the lead paint before applying a new nontoxic coat, but the initial test section looked bad. Therefore, the City's Operations Services Department has put out a Request for Proposals for lead abatement.

Steve White said two bids have been received. The local firm Risk Removal has bid \$12,910, while Environmental Abatement Services from Denver has bid \$8,900. The project includes all mechanical removal of the existing paint by scraping and sanding. As the abatement is completed, primer will be applied, and then a test area will be painted. After Ms. Tunner gives her approval, the entire building will be repainted. The colors will be white with green trim as it is now and also to match the other buildings on the property.

The project also includes repair of some rotted corner boards and replacement of a small amount of non-historic asbestos siding on the front, which is being custom made. Mr. White added the aluminum storm windows will be removed and the sills scraped. When rotted wood is encountered, he will discuss options with Ms. Tunner.

He said the goal is to get the building watertight, which may or may not require use of the storms. The City doesn't intend to do repairs until the use of the house has been determined. Mr. White said a study is underway with Aller-Lingle on possible uses of the house, which could affect the windows. Different things have been discussed, including classrooms, office space for the Natural Resources Department or residential use.

Agnes Dix asked about insulation; Ian Shuff suggested there probably isn't any. Steve White said that Nix family members who attended the Natural Resources open house said they had installed some underneath the floor, but other than that, no one is sure.

Public input: None.

Agnes Dix moved that the LPC accept the proposal for lead paint abatement on the small house at Nix Farm, 1745 Hoffman Mill Road, by Environmental Abatement Services, as explained by Steve White. Angie Aguilera seconded, and the motion passed unanimously, 5-0.

DETERMINATION OF ELIGIBILITY

210 W. Mulberry St. – Dana Lockwood, Lockwood Architects, owner's representative; introduced by Karen McWilliams.

In March 2001, the Director of Advance Planning, in consultation with staff and the chair of the LPC, determined that this building could have potential historical and/or architectural significance, and referred the owner's request for review prior to demolition to the Landmark Preservation Commission. This determination occurred before the changes to the Municipal Code in January 2003, which restricted such referrals to individually eligible buildings only, but staff and the LPC Chair felt that, in light of the previous referral, its eligibility should be reviewed by the full commission.

The owner is now interested in redeveloping the property, most likely as an extension of the ECS building next door, which belongs to the same owner. While the house, constructed in 1900 and at one time associated with the Charles and Anna Mercer family, has good integrity of design, location, workmanship and materials, and has been little altered since 1948, the property's integrity of setting and feeling has been compromised; it is now located between the radically different ECS building and a gas station.

Staff recommended the Commission make a determination that the house at 210 W. Mulberry is not individually eligible for landmark designation due to the lack of integrity of setting and feeling.

Dana Lockwood explained that he was involved in the design of the ECS Building, which has won a number of design awards since its construction in 1985, and the plan always was to expand on to this lot. The employee LLC that owns the building feels costs of construction as well as various code issues make it infeasible to attempt to incorporate the existing building into the expansion. Mr. Lockwood said that the house had lost its context, and agreed with Bud Frick when he pointed out that the ECS building itself was partly responsible for the loss of context.

Per Hogestad noted that the ECS building itself might become a landmark in the future, and any expansion would need to be sympathetic to it. He added that the 1900 building is a good example of the type of bungalow that exists in many locations throughout Fort Collins without other buildings, like that gas station, encroaching on them. Ian Shuff agreed, pointing out that other bungalows are better examples of the architectural style.

Public input: None.

Agnes Dix moved that the LPC find that the building at 210 W. Mulberry St. is not eligible for landmark designation due to its lack of integrity in setting and feeling. Ian Shuff seconded, and the motion passed unanimously, 5-0.

Per Hogestad said he will be interested to see what the new building looks like.

TRAINING PRESENTATION

The “F.R.E.S.H.” Approach – How to Determine Compatibility for New Structures in a Relatively (Visually) Consistent Historic District – written by Pratt Cassity, Executive Director, NAPC; PowerPoint presented by Carol Tunner.

F.R.E.S.H. stands for Footprint (foundation); Roof shape; Envelope; Skin and Holes, and the presentation looked at each element and how it contributes to the compatibility of a historic project to the surrounding neighborhood.

Ian Shuff felt that this presentation would make an excellent educational tool for local homeowners. He volunteered to find good and bad local examples, like those from Denver used in the PowerPoint, to adapt it for Fort Collins. He thought a printed version, in a simple 8x10” format, could be made available at the Building Department customer window to help raise awareness, while the PowerPoint could be run on the City’s cable channel 27. Per Hogestad agreed it would be a good starting point for the LPC’s new emphasis on educational outreach, and suggested Mr. Shuff look at the Eastside/Westside plans for additional graphics and examples.

OTHER BUSINESS

612 S. College Ave., the Darrah House –Gutter Change to K-style for the No-Interest Landmark Loan Program – no applicant present; introduced by Carol Tunner.

At the September 22 meeting, the LPC approved roof repairs and replacement that would include half-round gutters. The owners would like to use K-style gutters instead, both for aesthetic and practical attachment issues. There is no evidence of historical gutters being used on the house. Ian Shuff and Bud Frick both felt that the K-style will work better and stand up to snow better than the half-rounds would, and that gutters are reversible.

Public input: None.

Ian Shuff moved that the LPC approve the owner's request to use K-style gutters in place of the half-round style previously approved for 612 S. College Ave., Darrah House. Agnes Dix seconded, and the motion passed unanimously, 5-0.

Carol Tunner added that the roof is already on and looks good.

Meeting adjourned at 7:18 p.m.

Respectfully submitted by
Kate Jeracki, Recorder
December 1, 2004